VillageReach Malawi
October 20-21, 2011

VillageReach has two projects in Malawi.

1. **Kwitanda Community Health.** This is the project we saw on the first day of our visit. The project is fully supported by a single donor who has committed to continue supporting it for the foreseeable future. VillageReach is working in this area specifically because the Ministry of Health suggested Balaka because of its poor health indicators and the Balaka district health office chose Kwitanda because it was relatively worse off than the other parts of the district. VillageReach considered working to improve the vaccine supply chain (as it had in Mozambique), but determined in an initial assessment that the vaccine supply chain was functioning adequately. Through conversations with community members, VillageReach determined that the project should focus on reducing malaria and diarrhea rates. Components of the project include:
   a. *Employing an additional 6 health surveillance assistants (HSAs).* The government employed 17 in the area. In order to reach government's recommended ratio of HSAs to people, VillageReach trained and employs an additional 6 HSAs for the area.
   b. *Starting village clinics.* The government of Malawi has a policy that HSAs should be trained in basic diagnosis and treatment key childhood illnesses and receive a box of medicines. They should then run clinic days 2 days per week in which caregivers can bring under 5 children who are sick to receive basic treatments or be referred for higher-level care. The program has been slow to roll out. VillageReach has sped it up by providing the training, some basic furniture, and the first set of medicines to 14 HSAs in Kwitanda.
   c. *Malaria prevention:* Annual distribution of long-lasting insecticide-treated bed nets to vulnerable populations, and education work with the community and the HSAs to promote net usage.
   d. *Improving the Kwitanda Health Center.* VillageReach has provided some furniture, a scale, a vaccine refrigerator, and done some renovations to the health center building and the adjacent antenatal care clinic.
   e. *Water and sanitation.* VillageReach has fixed and built boreholes, built latrines, and provided training to HSAs in how to build cement coverings for latrines. The program also involves hand washing and sanitation promotion.
   f. *TB case detection.* VillageReach has set up a TB sputum collection points staffed by HSAs. People who have a cough can come to provide a sputum sample, which is then taken to the Kwitanda health center. At the health center the HSA responsible for TB in the district fixes the sample on a slide, and, once he has a few samples, takes them to the district hospital to examine under a microscope.
   g. *Bicycle ambulances for the community.*
   h. *Bicycles for HSAs* to assist them with transport to pick up medicines, submit reports, visit their villages, and attend meetings at the health center.
   i. VillageReach also mentioned establishing a distribution system for the village clinics and improving information exchange, but we did not discuss this component in detail.

2. **Information and communication technology for maternal and child health.**
   VillageReach is a subcontractor to Concern Worldwide on Innovations in Maternal, Newborn, and Child Health, a multi-year effort to support the development and field testing of inventive ways to save lives and improve the health of mothers and young children. Concern Worldwide held a competition in Malawi to solicit ideas for the project, and received over 6,000 ideas. Concern Worldwide provided a sub-grant to VillageReach to implement the two finalists’ ideas in the district of Balaka. The project started earlier this year and will continue until December 2012. It is being evaluated by Invest in Knowledge Initiative, which has done a baseline survey and will do an end line survey. The project
has three parts:

a. *Maternal and Child Health Case Management hotline*. Women and caregivers of young children can call in and ask a trained health worker questions. The project provides cell phones to community volunteers to assist with hotline access and the hotline is toll-free.

b. *Text and voice messages for pregnant women* to give them tips during their pregnancy on topics such as attending antenatal care, improving nutrition, creating a birth plan, estimating a due date, using a bednet, and getting a tetanus shot. There is also a tips service for caregivers of children under 1 year of age which focuses on immunization schedules, growth monitoring, nutrition, and danger signs for childhood illnesses.

c. *Booking system for health centers for ANC visits*. To reduce waiting times and improve health center readiness, this component of the project aims to get clinics to set up appointments for antenatal care visits.

**Day 1**

**Kwitanda Community Health Project:**

**Sanitation**

When VillageReach started working in Kwitanda, it visited all the boreholes and found many that weren't working and that as a result people were drinking from swamps and rivers. They determined that borehole repair should be a component of the project. The government recommends that there be 200 people per borehole but in many areas the average is closer to 500 people per borehole. In addition to repairing existing boreholes, VillageReach has also hired contractors to construct new ones.

We visited a borehole that VillageReach had repaired at a school that has 1177 students. This school was selected because VillageReach did a training there and saw its borehole was broken. The borehole was working when we were there. We met the maintenance committee, which consisted of 5 men and 5 women from the local village. They are supposed to be trained in maintaining the borehole by VillageReach, but this training hadn't yet happened. The borehole at the school had broken a few years before. A few organizations had promised to fix it but hadn't yet. VillageReach bought pipes and cement, and the village got some parts from another village with a broken borehole. Before the borehole was fixed, the students would bring water in bottles to school. The nearest borehole was at the health center in the area, but this one breaks a lot because it serves 600 people. The borehole has not broken again since VillageReach fixed it earlier this year.

VillageReach also works to improve access to sanitation facilities. It worked with HSAs to encourage improved pit latrines because traditional latrines tend to wash away in the rainy season and cause sanitation problems. They have trained HSAs in "san plat" casting (which stands for "sanitary platform"), i.e. creating concrete platforms over latrines that are easy to clean and allow people to cover the latrine when it's not in use. VillageReach told us that many of these have been casted, but some households have been slow to dig a pit and install them. These households report that they are waiting for their current latrine to be full and, once it is, they will make the new one. We saw one san plat latrine at the same school as the borehole. The latrine was locked and reserved for teachers. VillageReach said that this latrine should last for 5-10 years because the teachers only use it during the day. The teachers also have latrines behind their houses, which are within a fifty meters of the school, but by using the new latrine, they take less time away from class. There were also latrines for students (two pits for each girls and boys), but these were "unimproved" and consisted of uncovered holes in brick enclosures. There was also a urinal made out of straw.
Another sanitation intervention that VillageReach implements is the "tippy tap," which it learned about from Concern Universal. It consists of a water bottle connected to two strings – one on which it pivots and another which upends the bottle when a foot pedal is stepped on. The idea is that people can wash their hands after going to the bathroom without touching any surfaces. For the one we saw, the string was broken and the bottle did not have water in it.

**Malaria**

At the start of the project, VillageReach promoted bednet use but heard from people in the area that the barrier to use was access to nets not knowledge of the benefits of nets. VillageReach bought 3500 nets in 2009 (5000 were needed) and over 3000 in 2010 and 2011. They targeted vulnerable people: children under 5, orphans, chronically ill (HIV, TB), elderly, and the extremely poor, while pregnant women were targeted by PSI through health clinics. Because they didn't have enough funding for all of the groups originally targeted, they have since reduced their target group to children under 5.

**TB active case finding**

This project is based on the idea that many TB cases go undiagnosed in the community due to lack of knowledge about symptoms, lack of access to diagnostic services for TB, and distances or other barriers to going to the hospital or health center for TB testing. VillageReach told us that there is considerable evidence that community-based programs focused on encouraging “active case finding” of TB are far more successful at getting people diagnosed and treated for TB, as opposed to passive surveillance which only catches people who happen to come to the hospital or health center. Malawi's estimated TB case detection rate is currently under 50%, meaning that it is believed that more than half of TB cases are going undiagnosed and therefore untreated.

VillageReach first trained the HSAs in the Kwitanda catchment area and a group of volunteers in TB symptoms and identification so that they could be more actively looking for potential cases in the villages they support. VillageReach then set up community-based sputum collection points (sputum is mucus that is coughed up for testing) to further reduce barriers to testing by bringing testing points closer to the community. We visited two sputum collection points. These consist of a simple building, with a table, chair, bench, record book, and sputum collection containers.

At the first collection point, there were 2 HSAs and 10 volunteers who worked there on a rotating schedule. Both HSAs were there for our visit, though only one at a time is scheduled to be there each morning with 2 volunteers. We looked at the logbook. There was one positive case for the month. VillageReach said that the sputum collection points had found 4 positive cases since they were opened in August. There were a few blank results, which were people who submitted saliva instead of sputum, so the test wasn't valid. The volunteers are responsible for bringing the sputum to the health clinic within a day of when it is collected and they use a bike to get there. The next time a volunteer goes to the clinic, s/he picks up the results. People who have a positive result are sent to the district hospital and admitted for 14 days. After that they continue treatment at home for 6 months.

The HSA had two years of secondary school (“junior certificate”) plus the HSA training for 8 weeks. They also attend periodic short courses on particular topics. Not everyone is trained in the same skills. The HSA we spoke to at the first sputum collection point was trained in san plat casting, administering vaccines, TB case management, family planning, and prevention of mother-to-child transmission of HIV (PMTCT).

At the second collection point there were 3 HSAs there and 5 volunteers. The building was left over from a failed chicken-raising project and wasn't being used before the collection point opened. This one started at the end of September. There had been 22 samples submitted and no positives. VillageReach also hopes to add HIV testing to this site and the community is expecting
that (one of the volunteers talked about it), but the testing supplies at the district level have not been adequate. [Note from VillageReach: A community volunteer may have stated this, but it's not the accurate reason for why we haven't started the testing program. There have been issues with stock of tests at the health centers in Balaka, but I just want to clarify that this is not the reason why we haven't started the program – the program hasn't started because we are only just planning it, with intention to launch in January or February.]

The volunteer also requested food for the volunteers during their shifts. VillageReach said it couldn't do this.

**Village clinics**

Some HSAs receive special training and supplies to operate village clinics for sick children under 5 a few days per week (though mothers will often bring their children on other days too). We saw one of these in progress. There was a small straw structure, built by the village, in which the HSA had a table, a record keeping book, and a box of medicines. There were about 20 mothers with very young children in the structure, and another 20 or so waiting outside. According to the record book, the HSA had seen 13 children as of 11 am.

VillageReach said that this is a particularly active clinic because it covers a wide catchment area and the HSA makes himself very available. He's supposed to have clinics twice a week, but he holds them every day and is available at night. There are volunteers who are assigned to assist with the clinics. One volunteer came to the clinic in the middle of our visit.

This village was 9km from the Kwitanda health center. The furthest village in the catchment area is 19 km from Kwitanda. VillageReach said that some clinics don't function because the HSAs don't prioritize the clinic over other activities. We later stopped by one HSA's house and were told that she was in Balaka and wouldn't return in time to run her clinic the next day [Note from VillageReach staff who was with us: She travels to Balaka frequently for church activities, but I've never known her to miss her village clinic. I think the comment was that she would return in time to run her clinic the next day. Balaka is only ~30 minutes by bicycle from home.]

When we asked the HSA at the busy clinic how he determines what treatment to give, the HSA said he follows government recommended protocols. Examples of patients:

- Had diarrhea, given two ORS packets
- Coughing, 5 months old. The HSA measured the number of breaths per minute with a stopwatch and found that the rate was over the threshold. The protocol specifies that children with fast breathing should be assumed to have an acute respiratory infection (ARI). The HSA provided antibiotics and told the mother to give the child lots of water.

If the child has a fever, the HSA provides anti-malarial drugs. The only test is determining the child's temperature with a thermometer. The government only recommends testing for malaria for children over 5 (who aren't covered by these clinics).

The medicine in the HSA's box had been provided by VillageReach. The government wasn't supplying enough drugs for the village clinics, so VillageReach stepped in to fill the gap. The box contained, among other things, painkillers, anti-malarials, antibiotics, and oral rehydration solution (ORS) packets. When the HSA runs out of supplies he will have to go to the health center to pick up more.

We also visited the site of another village clinic and spoke with the HSA who runs it. It wasn't in session because it happens only on Mondays and Fridays, though he told us that patients do come on non-clinic days and he will treat them. The clinic is run under a tree outside of the HSA's house. He described the same procedures for treating patients as the other village clinic HSA and added that he checks the child's vaccination card to see if s/he is up to date. If not, he tells the mother to come to the once per month vaccination clinic that he runs in the community. He has to
collect the vaccines from the health center and use them on the same day because he does not have a refrigerator. The two most common problems he sees are diarrhea and fever. He had 62 patients in August. He said he is only able to follow up with patients who live close to him.

He seemed to be fully stocked for medicines. He picks these up at the Kwitanda health center routinely but his supply was recently supplemented by VillageReach. VillageReach gave him a bike to travel, though he said there was something wrong with it ("a dent"). He also has to go there to help with the supplementary feeding program, and to submit reports. He doesn't get much supervision. He is visited by the government health authorities once or twice a year (they look at the patient register and say 'good job'), and he can talk to the medical assistant at Kwitanda. He said that getting visits makes him feel like things are going well.

He said that he doesn't currently work with any other NGOs. Management Sciences for Health (MSH) provided family planning training, but now their project is over. He had received training in maternal and newborn health, sponsored by the WHO, and in TB from VillageReach. Two other NGOs that have worked in the area are GOAL, which did group counseling and feeding for people living with HIV, and the Malawi Red Cross Society, which did some activities similar to VillageReach's, but both pulled out due to lack of funds.

He said his favorite part of his job is running the village clinics because he feels that he can really help people. His least favorite part is riding his bike to the health center in the rainy season. He has been an HSA for 4 years and had dreamed of having this job since childhood. Many people apply for the job but only a few get it. HSAs make about $100 per month.

**Kwitanda health center**

This building contained a large waiting area, the medical assistant's office, and a closet-sized room in which the HSA in charge of TB prepares his samples, along with a few other rooms that we didn't go in. The staff includes one medical assistant, one nurse, one hospital attendant (takes patients to the hospital), a guard, and a laborer, as well as the 23 HSAs who serve the catchment area.

The medical assistant has worked at the health center for 11 months. After form 4, he had 2 years of medical training. He then worked at the district hospital for a while until the doctor had confidence in him and sent him to work unsupervised at the clinic. He hopes to get further training and move up within the field of medicine.

The health center has different days for different services. Antenatal care is on Tuesdays and Thursdays. Antiretroviral therapy is on Mondays. Group counseling for HIV is on Fridays. Malnutrition clinic is on Wednesdays. The medical assistant said that respiratory infections are the most common problems. There were no patients present when we were there. We were told that patients come in the morning, leave around 11 and come back around 2.

To get supplies, the clinic submits a list to the national Central Medical Stores. PSI supplies bednets. Supplies are delivered to the clinic. They are supposed to come every month. Last month they had enough nets, but they ran out of malaria treatment for pregnant women. VillageReach provided a vaccine refrigerator for the clinic. Before they had a refrigerator, vaccines had to be collected from the district hospital and used right away.

The medical assistant said the village clinics make his job easier. He said VillageReach is the only NGO working in the area.

The HSA in charge of TB demonstrated his sample preparing process, which was done in a small, ill-equipped room. Supplies had to be brought from other parts of the clinic and the HSA complained about the size of his working space. He seemed knowledgeable about the process. He said that samples have to be prepared in the way demonstrated within 48 hours of being
He said that he generally has about 15 samples per week, which has increased since the active case finding program started. He had had 26 so far in the month. He has 10 TB patients under his care currently, including both sputum positive and sputum negative patients (who are diagnosed another way). After patients are released from the hospital, he gives them their drugs and tells a neighbor to watch and see if the patient takes the drugs.

When I asked the HSA if anything had changed since VillageReach had started working there, he talked about the net distributions and the SanPlat casting. When I asked the medical assistant the same thing, he talked about the TB program, reduced diarrhea due to boreholes, and reduced malaria due to nets.

**Day 2**

*Note that the following is based solely on GiveWell's observations and notes taken during conversations. It does not represent a comprehensive picture of the described programs.*

We spent the day at the district hospital, meeting with district health coordinators and seeing the maternal health hotline headquarters. We also discussed the ICT for MCH project with Stacey, the project manager, and spoke with a hotline staffer. Stacey is an American who moved to Balaka earlier this year to run the project.

**Hotline**

The hotline was launched as a pilot in July. It currently serves four health center catchment areas, making up about 50% of the population in Balaka. Women call with questions like "how do I burp my baby," or will sometimes call to say "I had my baby safely." The health workers who staff the phone line are trained to respond to questions via Ministry of Health-approved protocols (some of these were hanging in the room in which they answer calls), and to record what happened on the call. Calls are recorded and a nurse, who is paid by VillageReach for his/her time, listens to a small percentage of the calls each week for quality control. The nurses are also referred the more difficult cases.

The hotline received 547 calls in September. About 33% of households in the area have phones, so there are community volunteers who tell their neighbors about the hotline and are given a phone for people to use. The line is toll-free. There are two staff members who staff the phone and are trained in listening skills in addition to the protocols.

**Text and voice reminders**

Pregnant women can sign up for periodic health messages on their personal phone or they can call in for their messages on the community phone. They can register so that they get messages timed to their stage of pregnancy.

Knowledge of antenatal care issues is very high in the country, so the reminders are about getting people to act on that knowledge.

Someone once called in and said, "I am getting a reminder to take iron pills, but I don't have access to iron pills." This has helped identify stock issues or other issues women are facing in accessing care.

Airtime is expensive in Malawi, so literate women get texts and illiterate women get voice messages. VillageReach is doing a small experiment in one area to see if there is a difference in effectiveness between text and voice.
Booking system

VillageReach has targeted two health centers to implement a booking system for antenatal care visits. Instead of providing women with a date and specific time, the health centers have a day for drop-in antenatal care visits and after a woman's first visit she can sign up for her next visit on a day with a limited number of slots. The women get SMS reminders about their upcoming appointment day.

The idea behind the program is that having scheduled appointments will reduce waiting time, make clinics better prepared, and give staff more control over their day. Wait times will be measured quarterly.

Meeting with district health coordinators

We met with 10 deputies in charge of particular health issues for the district. They have other jobs at the hospital in addition to this role. This was a subset of the coordinators whose work overlaps with VillageReach's work. They each had been asked to prepare a list of their challenges and successes.

- **Safe motherhood coordinator**: Delivery by skilled practitioners has been on the rise. The hospital staff discusses maternal deaths that occur to determine what went wrong. Challenges include getting women to come for antenatal care in the first trimester, lack of transport for supervision of HSAs, not enough HSAs with maternal and child health training, and difficulties following up maternal deaths.

- **Supply management coordinator**: Stock outs at the national level are a problem. She attributed this to a planning problem rather than a funding and corruption problem though he said that the Central Medical Stores will sometimes refuse to send drugs to a district because that district has an unpaid debt. Malaria drugs are overused because all child fevers are treated without testing. They did a test with 61 people with a fever and only 17 had malaria. Rapid diagnostic tests for malaria are now available but they aren't yet in the community.

- **Health promotion coordinator**: Knowledge transfer to HSAs is difficult. They don't have enough money to reach all the HSAs because of the cost and lack of availability of transport. It is hard to change ingrained behaviors.

- **Maternal and child health coordinator**: There was a program to train traditional birth attendants (TBAs) to conduct safer births, but studies did not show a positive effect, so the government decided to train them to bring the women to the hospital instead, which led to an increase in skilled deliveries. It remains a problem that TBAs are still assisting many births at home because many health centers don't have maternity wards and women are far from skilled care.

- **Environmental sanitation coordinator**: The goal is for everyone to be within 500 meters of safe water and to have access to pit latrines, hand washing facilities, and rubbish pits. The government protects shallow wells, supervises construction of sanitation facilities, collects data on water quality and access, provides water treatment (especially in the rainy season), and does water and sanitation mapping. In Balaka, 74% have access to safe water, though in some areas it's as low as 30%. 71% have latrines (15% are improved latrines). The rest defecate in the open. Challenges include lack of transportation and equipment. UNICEF used to provide water treatment supplies but they haven't in the last two years. Girls miss school because they are collecting water.
• **HIV coordinator:** The district has 15 health facilities but only 7 provide antiretroviral therapy (ART). There are 10,000 people in the district on treatment (we're not certain about this figure), including 1000 children. They are working on rolling ART out to the other health facilities, and expect to do it by next month. They have everything they need except training for the health workers. Challenges include patients dropping out and the government lacking transport to trace them, lack of testing kits, frequent breakdown of machines, shortages of second line treatment, and lack of space for the program at the hospital (a new building has been built but it lacks a transformer for the electricity).

• **EPI (immunizations) coordinator:** The program runs 184 outreach clinics through the HSAs. He ensures that vaccines arrive from Blantyre, that HSAs use good technique, and that gas is available to power the refrigerators. Some refrigerators are powered by electricity, which is a problem because there are blackouts. Some of these have solar as backup, but this hasn't been working. Vaccine coverage is above 80% for all vaccines except TTV. He is supposed to meet with HSAs quarterly, but he doesn't have enough funds to do this.

• **Nutrition coordinator:** 11% of children in the district are malnourished (we're not sure that we recorded this figure correctly). There is a Community Management of Acute Malnutrition (CMAM) program for children, and another program for adults. All health facilities provide CMAM and some provide inpatient care. UNICEF provides ready-to-use therapeutic food (RUTF), and the World Food Program provides cooking oil and corn-soy blend. The cure rate has been good, but the death rate is poor due to default and lack of volunteers to conduct follow-ups. The program was supported by Management Sciences for Health but that project is now over.

• **TB coordinator:** The biggest challenge is active case finding. Drugs are available from the Global Fund and cure rates are ok. To find cases they do sputum collection points, walk in service (get a test even if patient has only been coughing for a short time), establishing a microscope network, and monitoring and evaluation even at the private hospitals. They are not yet doing contact tracing and child contact treatment.

• **District Nursing Officer:** There is a need for more supervision of health workers but there aren't enough vehicles. They aren't able to collect the data they need to detect problems.

• **ITNs coordinator:** Nets are distributed to children under five and pregnant women through health facilities. There's an erratic supply of nets. The nets come from the Global Fund and are distributed by PSI. In preparation for the universal distribution campaign, they have trained HSAs, secured a warehouse, briefed leaders, and registered beneficiaries, asking how many useable nets they had and how many people lived in the house. They will receive 1.8 nets per person in a household and will distribute based on the number of sleeping spaces in the house. Reasons why people may not use nets include people perceiving that they make them hot, that it feels like a coffin, and a tradition in which people sleep outside for a few days after a relative has died. People don't buy nets because they have more immediate wants and needs and because they expect to receive nets for free.

• **Integrated disease surveillance coordinator:** The government monitors the occurrence of diseases like malaria, cholera, diarrhea, STIs, pneumonia, and measles, and produce weekly (for epidemic diseases) and monthly reports. They are limited by how regularly the health facilities submit reports - they often report late. Cases of cholera have to be reported right away. Since January there have been reports of measles cases and the government, with NGO support, have been conducting vaccination campaigns in some areas, though they can't afford to do it in all areas. The government was frustrated with many NGOs who said 'sorry, it's not part of our mandate.' VillageReach contributed some
fuel, and World Vision and Concern Universal were flexible enough to assist.

- Malaria coordinator: 31% of outpatients are malaria cases, and about a third of under 5 deaths in the hospital are attributed to malaria. The government uses four strategies for malaria control: prompt diagnosis and treatment, intermittent treatment in pregnancy (at 4 and 16 weeks), vector control, and education. There are shortages of drugs and IV fluids needed to administer drugs. They would like to have microscopic capacity to diagnosis cases, but this is lacking. Parents tend to bring the children to a health facility too late to save them. They have supplied nets but cases continue to increase, so they think that people must not be using the nets. Most pregnant woman get one dose of treatment, but the drug for this has been out of stock for 6 months. They lack educational materials such as posters and media awareness campaigns.

We also had a conversation about the costs and benefits of working with NGOs. The government coordinators said NGOs can be demanding about getting meetings with government, and sometimes they fail to coordinate with government, which can lead to situations such as having multiple groups soliciting volunteers in the same village. Many NGOs want the government to sustain their programs after the project is done, but they don't involve government enough in the planning process and aren't transparent about the costs of the program. NGOs can be focused on one sector so that if a child in their program has problem outside of the scope of the program, the NGO can't help with that, and this doesn't make sense to the government coordinators. On the positive side, NGOs bring a focus to their activities that the government sometimes lacks because NGOs are trying to meet objectives in a limited time period.

We asked if the government was currently running any programs that had been started by an NGO. None of the coordinators could think of anything and they started speaking in a Malawian language, which we didn't understand. A VillageReach staff member who had previously worked for Management Sciences for Health (MSH) reminded them that the government did retake responsibility for family planning from MSH after that project ended and that the government was maintaining an MSH project that set up radio communication between health centers and the hospital. The VillageReach manager of the ICT for MCH program asked if the government would consider taking over the hotline project when VillageReach's funding expired. The coordinators seemed hesitant and said it depended on the exit strategy and how much the program cost. They said they are already not receiving their full budgeted amount from the national government and adding to their responsibilities would be a big challenge. They said that with vehicles not working, a broken kitchen, and lights out in parts of the hospital, taking on a new project becomes "priority 16."

We discussed what they might used additional money for, and items that were mentioned included educational posters and videos in the local language, keeping the hotline program going, building a maternity ward at Kwitanda, hand washing promotion, and building additional boreholes.